Computer-delivered feedback: is written or oral more effective for beginner Spanish writing?

Nina Moreno
MorenoN@sc.edu

AATSP of the Carolinas 2017 Conference
Winthrop University
Overview of Presentation

• Types of feedback
• Brief description & results of study
• Reactions from students
• Software options
• Choosing the right type of feedback for your students
Types of feedback

• Explicit vs implicit → more or less metalinguistic information
• Oral vs written modality
• Immediate vs delayed
• Face-to-face vs computer-delivered

• [http://learning.cf.ac.uk/examples-of-feedback/](http://learning.cf.ac.uk/examples-of-feedback/)
Types of feedback

- Explicit vs implicit
- Oral vs written modality
- Immediate vs delayed
- Face-to-face vs computer-delivered
Comparison Studies

- **Advanced** (Elola & Oskoz, 2016) – no difference in proficiency results, but preferences:
  - Oral feedback for content
  - Written feedback for form

- **Intermediate** (Arnold & Ducate, 2012) – screencast (oral & visual) feedback group was slightly more successful

- **Beginning** – no known studies
Oral vs. Written Feedback

• Oral
  – Focus more on global aspects
  – Can listen many times
  – More personal
  – Motivating
  – May lead to better revisions
  – Can provide more depth
  – Students are better able interpret importance


• Written
  – Focus more on form
  – Can read many times
  – Quicker to correct for students
Present Project

- SPAN 109 classes Fall 2016 (N=25)
- 4 essays over semester using textbook tech components
- 1 essay received written feedback only & was revised
- 1 essays received oral feedback only & was revised
Research Questions

• How does type of feedback affect revision changes for beginning language students?

• What are student perceptions and preferences regarding type of feedback?
Methods

• Counterbalanced quasi-experimental design

• Intact classes of 1st semester Spanish

• 4 essays written; 2 analyzed (draft + revision)

• Coding based on uptake of grammar, spelling, vocabulary

• End of semester survey
Example of oral feedback
Composición: Un mensaje (Borrador)

Tu antiguo compañero de habitación ahora está estudiando en Argentina. Escribele una carta para hablar de sus arreglos de vivienda para este semestre. Sigue los siguientes pasos para escribir su mensaje:

1. Llueve de ideas (Brainstorming). ¿Qué palabras y frases puedes usar para describir sus arreglos de vivienda? Escriba varias palabras por tema.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Este semestre (This semester)</th>
<th>vivo en (place of residence during the school year)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Este semestre vivo en un apartamento</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Está en (location)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Está en Columbia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mi cuarto es (words to describe your room)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mi cuarto es muy grande</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mi compañero(a) de cuarto se llama (roommate’s name)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No tengo compañero</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Organización. Cuando escribes tu mensaje, incorpora lo siguiente:

- Salutación: Hola (name):
- Saludo: Saludos, (your name).
- Greeting: Pregúntale a él/a cómo está. Di cómo estás.
- Main body: Describe sus arreglos de vivienda, incluyendo a cualquier compañero de habitación.
- Final remarks: Pregunta a tu antiguo compañero de habitación dónde está viviendo este semestre.
- Closing: Saludos, (your name).

3. Borrador (First draft). Escribe tu borrador (aproximadamente 30-40 palabras) en el espacio de abajo.

Hola Rosa:


Saludos,
Example of written feedback
Hola Madeline: You have done a great job! The brainstorming section looks amazing and the body of your essay does too! Just one little thing: 3rd line "Vivo en una apartamenta' --> the word for apartment in Spanish is masculine. So check its spelling and then adjust the indefinite article ('una') to match a masculine noun. The rest looks wonderful!

2. Organización. As you write your message, incorporate the following:

- Salutation: Hola (name):
- Greeting: Ask him/her how he/she is. Say how you are doing.
- Main body: Describe your living arrangements, including any roommates.
- Final remarks: Ask your former roommate about where he/she is living this semester.
- Closing: Saludos, (your name).

3. Borrador (First draft). Write your first draft (about 30–40 words) in the space below.

Hola Ellis Ann:
How does type of feedback affect revision changes?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modality</th>
<th>Essay 1 - correct</th>
<th>Essay 1 - incorrect</th>
<th>Essay 2 - correct</th>
<th>Essay 2 - incorrect</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral- Spanish</td>
<td>40 (73%)</td>
<td>11 (27%)</td>
<td>32 (74%)</td>
<td>11 (26%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written - Spanish</td>
<td>26 (65%)</td>
<td>14 (35%)</td>
<td>39 (89%)</td>
<td>5 (11%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Oral > written

Written > oral

Highest % of uptake
Results from survey: Reactions

“I prefer **written** feedback bc it gives me the opportunity to easily to back and fourth [sic] from the feedback to my work & make revisions”

“I like the **written** feedback better as it allowed me to make revisions much more quickly.”

“I enjoyed the **spoken** feedback because A. I'm an auditory learner but more importantly, B. it forced me to analyze my work and apply what I was listening to. I also think it was easier on the professor to provide reading comments to learn and make corrections on my own”

“I prefer **spoken** feedback because it resembled receiving feedback in class where I am more inclined to comprehend the mistakes I made and am more likely to correct”
What are student perceptions and preferences regarding type of feedback?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oral</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No preference</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total (N)</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RQ 1: How does type of feedback affect revision changes for beginning language students?

• Results support previous findings for intermediate and advanced learners: no significant difference in uptake
RQ 2: What are student perceptions & preferences regarding type of feedback?

• Written feedback was preferred even though oral feedback was described positively in survey.

• In sum, students want to get as much information as possible to fix their errors. Written feedback does that in a more cost-effective manner (time-wise)
Advantages/Usefulness for each type of feedback

Oral feedback:

• **Builds rapport**: “The feedback was more personal and relatable.”

• “It was very kind but at the same time professional.”

• **Caters to auditory learning style**: “I was able to hear what was wrong with my composition instead of reading it. I'm much more open to oral learning rather than just reading material.”

• **Instructors**: time-saver, allows for more details

Written feedback

• **Adapts to self-paced correction / visual learning style**: “I liked the feedback I received because I could clearly read it and re-read it when needed without any problems.”

• **Instructors**: more time-consuming; does not lend itself for encouragement.
Conclusions

• No difference in type of feedback on L2 development in writing

• Affective benefit to oral feedback for some students

• Effective benefit to written feedback for most students.

• One third of participants: undecided
Spoken or Written or Both: How to Decide?

• Length of text
• Assignment objective
• Type of revisions required (form or content)
• Class size
• Technology available
Software for Providing Feedback

• Written
  – Word – Comment function
  – Word – Track Changes
  – Acrobat – scan and write with stylus

• Spoken
  – Built in to online textbooks
  – Audacity/phone > email to student
  – Microsoft Voice Recorder > on flashdrive
  – Vocaroo

• Written and Spoken
  – Jing
  – Screencast-o-matic
  – Camtasia
  – Cam Studio
Disclaimer

Vocaroo is provided in the hope that it will be useful, however we don't accept any responsibility for anything that happens ever (be it a result of you using this service or not). If nuclear war occurs because a Vocaroo message gets lost in the ether, it's not our fault. Disclaimers are wonderful things!

Vocaroo is still in BETA. This means it is still being developed, tested and tweaked. Accidents may and do happen, and messages may get lost or corrupted.

So please don't use this service for anything too important.

Also, by using this service you agree that your first born child will belong to us.
Enhance Your Online Conversations with Jing

Jing® is a computer service that lets you capture basic video, animation, and still images, and share them on the web.

Capture what you see
Capture an image of what you see on your computer screen with Jing. Simply select any window or region that you want to capture, mark up your screenshot with a text box, arrow, highlight or picture caption, and decide how you want to share it.

Record what you’re doing
Select any window or region that you would like to record, and Jing will capture everything that happens in that area. From simple mouse movements to a fully narrated tutorial, Jing records everything you see and do. Jing videos are limited to five minutes for instant, focused communication.

Send your video or screenshot
Send your screenshots and videos all over the web. As soon as you’re done with your screen capture or screen recording, it’s ready to upload to Screencast.com and share through IM, email, social media, and more.
Jing/Snagit

• Free screen capture application and video creation
• A bit of a learning curve
• 5 minute video recording limit
• Paid version: Snagit (one-time $49.95 + $12.49 for maintenance)
  – Snagit: longer videos, blur sensitive info, scroll long websites, etc.

  – https://youtu.be/5vLXQjo3xrY
Screencast-o-matic

Single-User Pro Recorder

Your individual user upgrade options on this account:

- **$18/year**
  - Upgrade
  - $1.50 per month!

- **$36/3 years**
  - Upgrade
  - Save $18 (33% Off)!

**Free Features:**
- 15-minute recordings
- Screen & webcam recording
- YouTube HD publishing
- Save as video file

**Pro Features:**
- No watermark
- Make longer recordings*
- Record Computer Audio (Windows Only)*
- Video Editor (Learn More)
- Scripted Recordings
- Draw and zoom
- Publish to Google Drive, Vimeo Pro, Dropbox
- Screenshot Tool
- Create captions with Speech-To-Text
- Import or use stock music

[https://screencast-o-matic.com/](https://screencast-o-matic.com/)
Feedback on longer writing/higher proficiency levels

• Mix of both
• Written to focus on grammar and punctuation
• Spoken to focus on global content, cohesion, coherence
  – Can provide more explanation
  – Students can listen over and over
  – Tone of voice can soften criticism

• Peer feedback
Limitations and Future Research

• Control variables: style of delivering feedback, different L2 structures & essay topics
• Small pool

• Longitudinal study for retention
• Content vs forms
• Other proficiency levels
Thank you!

• Nina Moreno morenon@sc.edu